COMMUNICATION PROCESS AND EVALUATION IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MODERN RETAIL POLICY IN DKI JAKARTA

Budi Santoso, Sunarto, Bernard Hasibuan, Dewi Widowati
Doctoral of Communication Science Programme; Sahid University, Indonesia, Moestopo University, Indonesia, Sahid University, Indonesia, Institut Komunikasi Dan Bisnis LSPR, Indonesia
E-mail: budi.santoso@kemendag.go.id, martosuwito.sunarto@gmail.com, Bernard_ukm@yahoo.com, dewiwidowati68@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
Received: October, 26th 2021 Revised: November, 16th 2021 Approved: November, 18th 2021	*Communication in the effective implementation of modern retail policies in DKI Jakarta will reduce the problems that arise in the modern retail sector. Modern and traditional retail will actually need and complement each other. The purpose of this study is to determine the ongoing communication process and evaluation of communication, so that problems will not arise and repeat themselves. This study uses systems theory from Katherine Miller, where there are three system concepts, namely system components, system processes and system properties. The three system concepts are to find out how the process and evaluation of communication work. This study uses a qualitative descriptive approach with a case study methodology. The communication process, both internal and external, is more of a procedure, so it is not yet fully an evaluation tool. Various communication evaluation efforts are more likely to be carried out to facilitate communication. The feedback process has not been responded well, so the resolution is still temporary. Based on the results of this study, the process and evaluation of communication in the implementation of modern retail needs to be prioritized on good message*

Budi Santoso, Sunarto, Bernard Hasibuan, Dewi Widowati

	management. Feedback needs to be studied more deeply, especially in external communication. Feedback from retailers can be used as an evaluation of why the implementation is running as expected.
KEYWORDS	Process, Evaluation, Communication, Implementation, Modern Retail

INTRODUCTION

The existence of modern retail has made the retail industry in Indonesia very competitive. Since the issuance of a policy regarding foreign investment, especially the entry of investment in the retail sector, traditional retail conditions have faced tougher competition. The unfavorable internal conditions of traditional retail such as management, facilities and shopping convenience have resulted in increasingly tough competition (Kim & Ryu, 2017). Realizing this condition, the government issued various regulations and policies so that modern and traditional retail can run side by side and synergize with each other (Tarigan, Jiputra, & Siagian, 2021). National retail policy development is carried out by the central government, while its implementation is carried out by local governments. Technically, local governments have policies through regional regulations as derivatives of regulations from the center (Cities & Governments, 2010).

In the implementation of these policies, there are still many that have not gone well. This can be seen from the violations committed by modern retailers such as zoning, partnership patterns with MSMEs or other violations. This violation can result in inefficient retail performance, both modern and traditional, which will ultimately harm each other. The retail industry competition does not stop there. The retail industry also has its own problems in competition. Changes in people's consumption patterns and current digital developments greatly affect the competition in the retail industry (Pantano, Pizzi, Scarpi, & Dennis, 2020).

The implementation of modern retail is a communication process between the government, retailers and stakeholders in conveying these policy messages (Tumewu, Massie, & Pandowo, 2019). Implementation will run well if the communication process is also effective. The process of communication as an interaction with both parties that encode, interpret, encode, transmit, and receive signals (Strinati & Barbarossa, 2021). Here we see feedback and an ongoing circle for sharing information. The communication process as stated by Schramm (1965), that the return process is called feedback, and plays a very important role in communication because it tells us how our message is interpreted. Does the listener say, "Yes, yes, that's true," when we try to persuade him or her? Does he nod in agreement? Did a confused frown appear on his forehead? Did he look away as if he had lost interest? An experienced communicator pays attention to feedback, and constantly modifies his message based on what he observes or hears from his audience.

Communication barriers in the implementation of modern retail can occur in the communication process. Various efforts have been made by the DKI Jakarta government so that the communication process between the community and the government goes well. These include several licensing services, public complaint channels and improvements to internal communication in service to the community. These various efforts can help streamline the communication process, especially with regard to modern retail. However, with some violations still occurring, it is necessary to evaluate the communication. A communication process is not merely seen as a communication process as a mere message exchange process.

According to (Schram, 1954) communication always requires at least three elements: source, message, and destination. The source may be an individual (speaking, writing, drawing, gesturing) or a communications organization (such as a newspaper, publisher, television station, or film studio) (Yazid & Mulyana, 2016). Messages can take the form of ink on paper, sound waves in the air, impulses in an electric current, a wave of a hand, a flag in the air, or any sign that can be interpreted. The target may be an individual listening, watching or reading; or members of a group, such as discussion groups, audiences for lectures, football audiences, or members of mass media audiences. Schramm argues, although in radio or telephone communication the encoder can be a microphone and the decoder is an earphone, in human communication, the source and encoder are one person, while the decoder and target are another person, and the signal is language. To complete a communication act, a message must be decoded.

The communication process in an organization can be seen from the systems theory approach. Systems theory aims to explain the dynamic relationships and interdependencies between system components and the relationships between organizations and the environment. A system is based on the structure and model of relationships resulting from the interactions between components. Because of these emerging patterns and relationships, each system is different from one another. In other words, unlike biological systems, the components of social organization have their own will and purpose.

Systems theory does not originate from organizational studies but more in the fields of biology and engineering. One of the main founders of the systems movement was (Von Bertalanffy & LaViolette, 2019), a theoretical biologist who was interested in the study of "living systems" within his own academic field. However, (Von Bertalanffy & LaViolette, 2019) was also concerned with the extent to which intellectual disciplines were isolated from one another, and he argued that the concept of systems could be applied to a large number of fields in the natural and social sciences.

Furthermore, (Miller & Barbour, 2014) explains systems theory into three system concepts. The three concepts are system components, system processes, and system properties. Although there is substantial variation in the details presented about systems theory across different subject areas, nearly all systems theory embrace certain aspects of systems metaphor. In this explanation, consider a number of concepts supported by various systems theory. First, look at what components make up the system. Then consider how the system works – system processes.

Finally, we can discover the unique characteristics that emerge from the system's components and processes.

The three concepts of the system each have different aspects. System components consist of aspects of hierarchy, dependability and openness. System processes consist of input and output processes that require exchange between the system and the environment. Process throughput requires exchange between system components. System control is maintained through feedback. Corrective (negative) feedback serves to keep the system stable. Growth feedback (positive) serves to shape or change a system. Furthermore, the nature of the system consists of holism, equality, negative entropy and the necessity of diversity. A system is more than the sum of its parts, interdependent for an outcome of a system. The system avoids damage and evolves and the system maintains internal complexity (Jones, 2015).

In order for the communication process to run effectively, a communication evaluation is carried out. Improvement efforts in the communication process are part of a communication evaluation to obtain results or effective implementation. In this way, things can be identified and acted upon that could hinder the communication process so that implementation can run well. With this background, a study is needed to see the process and evaluation of the communication that occurs. The research takes a case study of the implementation of modern retail policies in DKI Jakarta. This is because DKI Jakarta has the largest number of modern retailers among provinces in Indonesia. Based on this, a research was conducted on the Process and Evaluation of Communication in the Implementation of Modern Retail Policy, with a case study of the implementation of modern retail policies in DKI Jakarta.

RESEARCH METHOD

This research is descriptive with a qualitative approach, or descriptive-qualitative research (Sugiyono, 2019). The research method used is Case Study. Case study research is used with the consideration that this research model emphasizes the exploration of a detailed system with in-depth data mining involving various sources of information. In this context, explaining with reference to the process of establishing a set of causal relationships about how or why something happened. The process is usually iterative and involves making initial predictions, and comparing them with case study evidence. Then, based on any variance, the initial predictions are revised and compared with additional evidence and/or cases. This process is repeated until a satisfactory match is obtained. In the case study, explanation building is formed in the narrative (Yin, 2009).

Sources of data used in this study are primary and secondary data. Meanwhile, in the interview, the informant was determined based on purposive sampling technique. The informants consist of several officials from the Ministry of Trade and related agencies who handle modern retail policies and arrangements. In addition, several informants from business actors, associations, retail observers and consumers.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Communication Process

The process of communication as an interaction with both parties that encode, interpret, encode, transmit, and receive signals. Here we see feedback and an ongoing

circle for sharing information. In this study, the communication process is carried out between communicators and communicants both on internal communication patterns and external communication patterns. The pattern of internal communication is the internal communication process in communicating both licensing registration and modern retail development and supervision. In the pattern of internal communication, those who act as communicators and communicants will take turns depending on their interests in communicating something.

This pattern of internal communication is carried out by subsystems, systems and super systems that exist in the structure and process of licensing services as well as in the modern retail development process. This communication process is formal in that each has a different role and position in making decisions. Position factor in this communication process is very decisive in decision making. Every decision is a joint decision with the applicable legal corridor.

Like other types of communication, internal communication involves a sender, receiver, and content, which is transferred through a specific medium. It should be understood as a management task, which can make a positive contribution to the success of the organization. It consists of "all formal and informal communication" taking place internally at all levels of the organization", including the exchange of "ideas, information, attitudes and emotions" (Barendsen, Muß, & Silvius, 2021). Internal communication can play an important role in generating the right conditions to encourage employee advocacy behavior (Thelen, 2020).

Communicators in this process can be leaders or staff. Information obtained from retailers may be received by staff or leaders, where in internal communication the recipient of the message from this retailer will turn into a communicator. When the discussion process is in the internal phase, the leadership and staff will switch roles both as communicators and communicants.

In this communication process, feedback and message processing play a very important role. The communicator and the communicant will act as a decoder and encoder at the same time alternately. Feedback expected in this communication process will be a mutual agreement. Although the role and power of each message will be different. This is like the role of each in a system described by Katherine Miller's system model.

A Head of Service, for example, in the communication process will provide directions to subordinates. The Head of Service conveys a message to subordinates, the message conveyed is a directive or instruction to be implemented. Staff receive and process messages to translate what the boss wants. This process continues and staff relay back to superiors on previous directions. This is where the superiors and staff will always take turns as both communicators and communicants. Whatever the process and meaning of the communication carried out, the communication process between the two is a communication with the expected feedback from each.

The staff here functions to carry out orders from superiors conveyed through the communication process. When the return message is conveyed by the staff at the direction of the leadership, the communication process from the staff to the leadership can be one-way because the staff only conveys the results of the leadership's direction. However, the communication process may get feedback from the leadership if there are other directions from the leadership. This is where the role of communicators and communicants changes depending on the interests and goals of the communication process itself.

Likewise, communication between officials who have different levels, then between superior officials and subordinate officials is more of an instruction from the

highest leadership in the system. The communication process is carried out to translate messages conveyed by superiors. Furthermore, the feedback expected by the leader is to carry out the instructions. If an instruction is executed, the lower official continues the communication process to convey the results of the direction of the higher-level official. If the superior official has a response, then the response may be in the form of a new directive, or the superior official has been able to accept the results of the work.

Meanwhile, the communication process between staff is discussing messages that have been received from outside and also from the leadership. Lateral communication is carried out by groups in the system to communicate incoming messages from outside and then communicate these messages to the leadership. Feedback from the leadership in the form of messages to staff is then communicated laterally within the group. However, not all information from outside is accepted by staff. Leaders can also receive outside information related to modern retail.

Each performs the encoder and decoder processes and vice versa. The feedback or feedback expected by each is to be able to carry out their duties properly. The staff always tries to carry out the leadership duties well. Likewise, a leader hopes that messages conveyed to subordinates can be followed up properly.

Meanwhile, in external communication patterns, this communication pattern, both communicators and communicants will also take turns. The communicator can be from the retailer who conveys the message to the communicant, in this case the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government. Likewise, the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government as a communicator conveys messages to retailers as communicants. Messages from retailers can be received by staff and leaders. Because apart from using existing channels, retailers often communicate directly with office leaders in the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government. Both communicators and communicants will respond to each other's messages that have been received. Messages received from retailers and messages sent to retailers are re-communicated through internal communication patterns.

In the pattern of internal and external communication will be interrelated with one another. The pattern of communication between the two is to respond to each other and convey messages. Responses by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government will then be processed in internal communications, to be submitted to retailers. And so on, the communication process continues until a decision is issued.

Messages conveyed by each can be received and processed properly. However, the pattern of external communication carried out by the DKI Provincial Government with retailers cannot run quickly, because of the bureaucratic process that occurs in the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government. This is done because decision making is done in a system. External communication will experience obstacles when each has difficulty processing the message conveyed.

External communication patterns also often occur when conducting field supervision or when mediating between retailers and MSMEs. The communication process is also carried out when formulating new policies related to retail. Policy formulation always involves relevant stakeholders, including the business world or associations of modern retailers. The interests of each stakeholder meet to communicate to find a solution. However, due to different interests, usually the policy results cannot satisfy all parties. The middle way is taken so that everything goes well for the common good.

The communication process in the implementation of modern retail policies tends to be normative in which the priority of the procedure takes precedence over the result. This can be seen in the licensing registration process, where if the requirements have not

been met, an agreement can be made with the fulfillment of commitments to be realized in the future. This process can make it easier for retailers but violations still occur frequently because not all retailers fulfill these commitments.

The message conveyed is also an important consideration in implementing modern retail policies, both by retailers and by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government. Every communication process so far has not been studied properly, so that the communication problems that occur they do not know exactly. The evaluation was not carried out optimally by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government on the retailer's response. For example, what is the reason why the policy cannot be implemented properly, has not been carefully understood by the Provincial Government of DKI Jakarta.

Feedback received from retailers should be carefully reviewed so that it can be seen where the contributing factors are. According to retailers, one of the causes of the policy not working well is the substance of the policy itself. Not all policies applied to retailers can be easily implemented. Thus, feedback or reactions from retailers who do not comply with these provisions should be evaluated by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government.

From this communication pattern, it can be seen that the communication process that occurs is like a formal communication by communicating what should be communicated in general. Messages conveyed by retailers, either verbally or through actions by ignoring retail policies, have not been able to respond properly by the government as feedback for further study.

In external communication, both retailers and the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government sometimes have difficulty understanding the feedback received quickly and clearly. This is because each has a different interpretation. Even though each one has done encoder and decoder but the feedback does not necessarily go as expected. This is where the communication process that occurs can be seen to what extent the feedback is expected by each party.

The external communication process is a process that actually really determines the success or failure of a modern retail policy implementation in DKI Jakarta Province. From this communication, it can be seen what problems are faced by business actors so that retail policies do not work well. Feedback that is managed well by the DKI Jakarta Government can help to find out what problems are actually happening in DKI Jakarta.

Overall that the communication process in the implementation of modern retail is based on going well, there is no communication process that is deadlocked or hampered. But the essence of communication itself needs to be understood further. This is because the communication process is more likely to be carried out to complete routine work, so that the problems that arise cannot be revealed from the communication process. Thus, so far the orientation on procedures takes precedence over results.

Communication Evaluation

Evaluation of communication in the implementation of modern retail has been carried out by the DKI Jakarta government in an effort to overcome communication barriers. Communication barriers that occur can result in implementation not going well. Several evaluation efforts were carried out both in the internal and external communication processes.

The various communication evaluation efforts carried out include: First, discussions are often held in deciding problems as well as eliminating communication barriers between leaders and subordinates. The internal communication process in DKI Jakarta that is involved in the implementation of modern retail often experiences

obstacles when the communication process occurs between superiors and subordinates. Realizing this, evaluations are often carried out in finding these obstacles.

The nature of the evaluation is to evaluate ongoing activities, however, communication barriers are a top priority. Thus, the communication process due to structural positional barriers can be overcome. The communication process between superiors and subordinates is unavoidable from the influence of the bureaucracy. However, this obstacle is overcome by discussion processes so that it is not too formal in conducting communication. The communication process that is too formal causes the expected results to be not optimal, as well as the quality of these results.

Second, minimize the occurrence of communication between retailers and leaders with the hope that all decisions are made in accordance with applicable regulations. Some retailers, especially if there is a problem, often communicate directly with the leadership in DKI Jakarta. It is hoped that the problems encountered will be resolved soon. However, conditions like this in practice can actually lead to new violations. This is because there will be potential for solving problems that are not in accordance with applicable regulations.

This communication process is indeed more effective because it is carried out between leaders, both from retailers and from the DKI Jakarta government. This communication process between leaders can occur at the time of licensing registration as well as in the process of coaching and supervising activities. This can happen if there are obstacles or problems. Under normal conditions, the communication process is usually carried out in accordance with applicable procedures.

Third, it involves active participation in the team so that every decision taken is a joint decision. In the licensing registration process, there is a technical team that jointly carries out the communication process with retailers. This communication process is carried out to decide if the licensing registration will be approved or not. Likewise in internal communication, this technical team will discuss to make decisions.

Considering that the Technical Team consists of several units, the active role of each party is emphasized in every discussion. Although sometimes the problems that arise will tend to lead to certain units or services, efforts are always made to keep other units/services active in providing input. The active participation of each member will greatly assist in decision making.

Fourth, institutionalize communication procedures into an institution such as a licensing registration institution. As of January 2, 2015, PTSP DKI Jakarta Province was inaugurated. Initially named the One Stop Service Agency (BPTSP) DKI Jakarta Province. One Stop Service, hereinafter abbreviated as PTSP, is the activity of administering licensing and non-licensing whose management process from the application stage to the issuance stage of the document is carried out in an integrated manner with a one-stop system in the Province of the Special Region of Mothers. Jakarta city.

The purpose of implementing PTSP is to provide convenience and certainty for the community in obtaining licensing and non-licensing services. Convenience is the convenience for the public to obtain licensing/non-licensing services and obtain information about the place, time, costs, requirements, procedures, submission and settlement of complaints for non-licensing licensing services.

Modern retail licensing services are also part of PTSP services. This service will facilitate the communication process between retailers and local governments. This service is expected to be able to avoid communication barriers and improper practices such as Collusion, Corruption and Nepotism.

PTSP is more of a licensing/non-licensing service, thus retail problems related to

existing violations are not easily resolved at PTSP. Completion at PTSP tends to be technical in nature, especially with regard to registration. However, the handling of other problems such as violations will be carried out by related units with their respective approaches.

In PTSP, a consultation room is usually provided. This room is prepared for retailers or other applicants if they want to conduct consultations. Consultation is a communication process carried out between retailers and PTSP to consult on issues related to licensing registration. In this communication process, it is hoped that there will be a clear understanding so that retailers can register correctly.

Sixth, improving the public complaints service of DKI Jakarta from time to time, through the development of the Rapid Response Community (CRM) system or Citizen Relations Management as a refinement of the Rapid Response Public Opinion (CROP) application. This application is used by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government apparatus to accommodate, coordinate, and follow up on reports from residents of the capital that are non-emergency in nature.

CRM is integrated with 14 complaint channels, where a citizen reports through one of the 14 complaint channels. The report will be entered into the CRM system and received by the local kelurahan or related agency to follow up on the report. There are 14 official complaint channels based on geotagging and non-geotagging that can be used, namely: JAKI (Jakarta Kini); Qlue; Twitter @DKIJakarta; DKI Jakarta Provincial Government Facebook; Electronic mail dki@jakarta.go.id; Balai Warga Jakarta.go.id; Governor of DKI Jakarta Social Media; Sms REPORT 1708; SMS 08111272206; District Office; District office; Mayor's office; City Hall Hall; Inspectorate Office.

The public complaint channel can also be related to modern retail problems. People can complain about problems related to modern retail. Complaints are related to regular retail as they relate to zoning or licensing. Usually the procedure with this complaint channel is carried out because of the unrest that arises in the community because of the retail problem in question. Meanwhile, other retail problems are mostly solved in offices/units that handle retail.

Based on the various efforts that have been made by the DKI Jakarta Government, it can be explained how the communication system is currently running in the implementation of modern retail. Some of the things that become the weakness of the communication system in the implementation of modern retail can be seen from the current communication process. The communication process in the implementation of modern retail is carried out in internal and external communication patterns. In the communication process, both internal and external, the feedback factor plays an important role. Feedback can be used as a means to evaluate.

Feedback problems arise more often in the external communication process between the DKI Jakarta Provincial government and business actors. The feedback received by the DKI Jakarta government from business actors or vice versa has not been responded to properly. The communication process in the implementation of modern retail in DKI Jakarta has not been used as a tool for evaluating. Evaluations often come from the central government after getting some pressure and pressure from outside. More evaluations should come from local governments, because modern retail policies are implemented in the regions. Thus, the local government should know more about the problems in the field.

The cases of violations have not been responded to optimally by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government to evaluate what is happening in the field. The pattern of communication between retailers and the government should be a means to find out the

cause of the implementation not going well. Modern retail evaluation is carried out thoroughly on all sectors involved, especially MSME suppliers and traditional retailers. Thus, through this communication system, monitoring and evaluation processes can be carried out. Violations committed may indicate that regulations may not be enforced or fully enforced by modern retailers. This is where the need for speed of government response in the development of modern retail.

For example, changing the 80% obligation for modern retailers to market domestic products is one example. The policy has been amended by Regulation of the Minister of Trade of the Republic of Indonesia Number 23 of 2021 concerning Guidelines, Arrangements and Guidance for Shopping Centers and Supermarkets, in which this obligation has been removed. Meanwhile, this problem has been around for a long time, but it is only now that changes have been made. This change also did not appear because of pressure from the local government.

Communication evaluation will also be able to find out other problems such as the existence of MSMEs with the existence of the modern retail. Violations committed by modern retailers related to partnership obligations with MSMEs must be seen as more essential problems. Through the communication process, it can be seen what each role needs to be maintained so that both can actually need each other. The two sectors can actually create an ecosystem that needs each other.

The evaluation process of retail implementation communication has been running in the implementation of modern retail in the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government. However, the evaluation of communication is more aimed at short-term solutions. The evaluation carried out tends to be resolved at the technical level. This evaluation is carried out as an effort to resolve problems quickly, so that what emerges are temporary policies.

CONCLUSION

The process and evaluation of communication in the implementation of modern retail plays an important role. The communication process that runs effectively will help in the implementation process. As in this study, the communication system in the implementation of modern retail can be seen and evaluated where the weaknesses are, so that in the future the communication system can be improved to make it more effective.

This study describes how the communication process, and communication evaluation carried out by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government in the context of implementing modern retail policies. The communication process is described in the licensing registration stage as well as the development and supervision stage of modern retail policies. The communication process in the implementation of modern retail in DKI Jakarta Province needs to put more emphasis on feedback. Feedback, both in internal and external communication patterns that should be used as a medium for conducting an evaluation, has not functioned optimally.

Evaluation of communication in the implementation of retail policies based on the communication process tends to be carried out for completion at the technical level. The evaluation is in the form of many policies that are temporary in nature, so the same problems will often arise in the implementation of modern retail policies. Temporary settlements will be justification for business actors to do the same. Communication evaluation should be able to evaluate national policies, so that local governments as retail coaches in their regions can provide input to the central government.

Success in the implementation of modern retail can be seen from various perspectives. The communication system is one way to see where communication problems arise so that implementation does not go well. Good implementation will have a

good impact on the development of the retail industry and other sectors related to this industry. Katherine Miller's system theory illustrates that the system that has been implemented by the government will have broad implications for the business world and related stakeholders. With this theory, the process of internal communication within the government and external communication will help problems that arise, especially in the implementation of modern retail in DKI Jakarta Province.

REFERENCES

Barendsen, Welmoed, Muß, Anja C., & Silvius, Gilbert. (2021). Exploring team members' perceptions of internal sustainability communication in sustainable project management. *Project Leadership and Society*, 100015.

Cities, United, & Governments, Local. (2010). Local government finance: The challenges of the 21st century. *Second Global Report on Decentralization and Local Democracy*.

Jones, Dean P. (2015). Redox theory of aging. *Redox Biology*, *5*, 71–79.

Kim, Woo Hyoung, & Ryu, Tae Chang. (2017). Input-output analysis on the economic effect of the Korean traditional retail market supporting project. *The Journal of Distribution Science*, *15*(7), 5–17.

Miller, Katherine, & Barbour, Joshua. (2014). *Organizational communication: Approaches and processes*. Cengage Learning.

Pantano, Eleonora, Pizzi, Gabriele, Scarpi, Daniele, & Dennis, Charles. (2020). Competing during a pandemic? Retailers' ups and downs during the COVID-19 outbreak. *Journal of Business Research*, *116*, 209–213.

Schram, Wilbur Ed. (1954). *The process and effects of mass communication.*

Strinati, Emilio Calvanese, & Barbarossa, Sergio. (2021). 6G networks: Beyond Shannon towards semantic and goal-oriented communications. *Computer Networks*, *190*, 107930.

Sugiyono, Prof. Dr. (2019). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Tarigan, Zeplin, Jiputra, Juan, & Siagian, Hotlan. (2021). The effect of supply chain practices on retailer performance with information technology as moderating variable. *International Journal of Data and Network Science*, *5*(1), 47–54.

Thelen, Patrick D. (2020). Internal communicators' understanding of the definition and importance of employee advocacy. *Public Relations Review*, *46*(4), 101946.

Tumewu, Claudia, Massie, James D. D., & Pandowo, Merinda H. C. (2019). THE ANALYSIS OF BEFORE AND AFTER THE PRESENCE OF MODERN RETAIL ON TRADITIONAL RETAIL IN MOTOLING. *Jurnal EMBA: Jurnal Riset Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis Dan Akuntansi*, *7*(3).

Von Bertalanffy, Ludwig, & LaViolette, Paul A. (2019). *A systems view of man*. Routledge.

Yazid, MirawatiYanita M., & Mulyana, Andy. (2016). Determinant Analysis for Rubber Export in Indonesia. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, *6*(9), 478.

Yin, Robert K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (Vol. 5). sage.